Abstract

Purpose: In order to address the problem of human alienation due to anxiety, stress, and economic polarization in our society, meditation programs have emerged as an important means in the fields of psychology and psychiatry, and hence, this study was conducted to verify the effect of grateful meditation program on the psychological variables.

Method: This study is a literary analysis study, and by examining 8 papers on grateful meditation programs conducted in Korea, the contents of gratitude and meditation methods used for these studies were analyzed, and the effects of these programs on the dependent variables.

Results: First, as for the contents of gratitude used for these programs, the greatest number of gratitude was for one’s own body (8th paper), one’s own existence (7), family (6), neighbors (5), nature (5), friends (4), and objects (2) were analyzed as the most, respectively Second, as for the meditation method adopted for the grateful meditation program, it was analyzed that breathing meditation was used for the preparation phase, visualization meditation or mantra meditation was primarily used for the development phase, and motion meditation was partially used for the finishing phase. Third, the grateful meditation program was analyzed to be effective across all dependent variables (satisfaction of life, positive and negative emotions, self-esteem, anger, disposition of gratitude, and interpersonal relationships) set for 8 studies.

Conclusion: First, the future grateful meditation program ought to change the contents of the gratitude according to age. Second, the method of meditation ought to also change according to age. Third, the contents of gratitude or the method of meditation ought to be changed according to the dependent variable to be improved through the grateful meditation program. Fourth, if the ‘time of consideration for myself’ is preceded by the grateful meditation preparatory program for palpating my cognition, emotions, and actions, it would be possible to proceed more effectively and in depth during the development phase, grateful meditation. Hence, the grateful meditation program is a powerful program in promoting the cognitive, emotional, and the behavioral changes for the participants, and hence, it ought to be more systematic and widely used moving forward.

[Keywords] COVID-19, Anxiety, Stress, Grateful Meditation Program, Effect

1. Introduction

1.1 Need and purpose of the study

Today, more than ever, we live in an era of fast changes in the natural environment. Unexpected extreme weather events including drought, flood, heat wave, wildfire, and cold wave are reported each and every day through the news, and the world is suffering from the outbreak of viruses such as COVID-19[1][2][3]. Such changes in the natural environment cause anxiety and stress in people, weaken their immunity, and even lead to their death. From the perspective
of the socio-cultural environment, the 4th industrial revolution characterized by the development of capitalism, the revolution of the Internet, and the development of artificial intelligence is rapidly progressing[4], which polarizes the social structure and further deepens the sense of alienation among the individuals[5]. In order to address the problems of anxiety, stress, polarization, and human alienation, a meditation program has emerged as an important means across the fields of psychology or psychiatry in recent years[6][7][8][9].

Meditation literally means the 'act of meditating quietly' or 'quietly settling in thoughts,' and also means the act of 'letting go of desires and thoughts but remaining awake clearly.' Meditation began with yoga meditation in India and developed into the Buddhist meditation. Yoga meditation refers to reaching the state of concentration, which is a state in which the mind is completely emptied and only the object emits light by stopping and controlling the agitation of the mind[10], while the Buddhist meditation leads to nirvana through transcendence, and nirvana is the most profound state of consciousness, referring to a state of awakening without an object of attachment.

As the meditation training methods developed in the East have been introduced in the west, various meditation training methods have also been introduced as effective self-regulation techniques for promoting health and cope with stress, which include Transcendental Meditation, Benson’s Relaxation Response Method, and Carrington’s Clinical Standard Meditation Method, respectively.

In line with the development of such meditation practices, causing one to have a grateful mind has emerged as an important issue in psychology[11][12]. The recent emphasis on the concept of gratitude in psychology coincides with the rise of positive psychology. Positive psychology is a new trend in psychology which focuses on positive psychology such as individual strengths and virtues rather than negative emotions such as anxiety, depression, and stress, which was founded by Seligman of the University of Pennsylvania[13][14][15]. He began it by reflecting on the fact that the existing psychology focused only on alleviating psychological conditions which made one’s life unhappy, such as treating mental illness, and did not look back on the positive values of life.

As positive psychology has emerged, studies on gratitude have actively been conducted in psychology as well. Seligman, Tayyab Rashid, and Parks (2006) claimed that if a lot of negative language is used, the learned helplessness would be demonstrated, yet if a positive language is used repeatedly, life would be full of energy[16], while Seligman & Csikszentmihalyi (2000) claimed that gratitude is the foundational attitude for successful roles in life[17].

The grateful meditation program is one which uses meditation as a means to have a grateful mind as contents, and develop such a mind. As examined earlier, the grateful meditation program is one which ought to be highly valued in that it is a program for instilling a grateful mind and in that it uses a quiet and effective method of meditation[18][19][20].

This study has examined the effects of grateful meditation programs conducted in Korea (for a total of 8 papers), and analyzed the contents of the gratitude and meditation methods set by such programs, while analyzing the relevant effects of such programs on various psychological variables. By conducting this study, it is expected that the grateful meditation program will provide the necessary information to be more systematic and widely used moving forward.

1.2. Research questions

The research questions set for this study are as follows. First, what are the contents of gratitude presented by the grateful meditation program? Second, what kind of meditation method is adopted by the grateful meditation program? Third, what is the effect of the grateful meditation program?
2. Theoretical Background

2.1. Theory of gratitude

Gratitude is among the virtues which have been treated as important in the field of religion or philosophy for a very long time[21][22][23]. The Christian Bible provides, “Give thanks for everything,” which means that giving thanks for everything is very important. Talmud provides, “The wisest person in the world is a learner, and the happiest person in the world is a person who lives with gratitude.”

The meaning of gratitude in Buddhism provided by “Bosaljjigyeong” is deep. There is a verse which says, “If I get something, I know about the amount and know how to be satisfied. If someone asks me, I do not disobey his or her intention, and if someone hates me and rebukes me, I would still repent and be grateful.” This means that even to the person who hates and criticizes me, be grateful. It is easy to thank those who do good to me, but it is difficult to thank those who hate me. However, gratitude in Buddhism includes a deep sense of gratitude which is enough to give thanks to even those who oppose oneself.

Regarding gratitude, Thomas Aquinus said that knowing that many people have contributed to the positive results one has achieved is the key to gratitude, and Swiss philosopher Carl Hilty, in his “Theory of Happiness,” says, “Be grateful and you will be young. Be grateful, then there will be progress. Be grateful, and there will be joy.” This may be understood as an implicit expression that giving thanks makes the body healthy and the mind happy.

The etymological meaning of gratitude is an emotional state which expresses the characteristic or state of being grateful, and the characteristic of wanting to return a favor, and hence, the experience and expression of gratitude has been regarded as basic and desirable in terms of human character and social life[24].

The recent emphasis placed on the concept of gratitude in psychology coincides with the rise of positive psychology. Positive psychology is a new trend in psychology which focuses on positive psychology such as individual strengths and virtues rather than negative emotions such as anxiety, depression, and stress, and was founded by Seligman of the University of Pennsylvania. He began it by reflecting on the fact that the existing psychology focused only on alleviating the psychological state which made life unhappy, as seen in the treatment of mental illness, and failed look back on the positive values of life.

As positive psychology has emerged, the studies on gratitude were actively conducted in psychology. Seligman (2006) said that if a lot of negative language is used, learned helplessness symptoms will be demonstrated, yet if positive language is used repeatedly, life will be full of energy[16], Seligman & Csikszentmihalyi (2000) claimed that gratitude is the foundational attitude for successful roles in life[17].

Lazarus, R.S., and Lazarus, B.N. defined gratitude as one of the empathic emotions felt after receiving help from others, and claimed that it is based on the ability to empathize with others[25]. Weiner claimed that gratitude is an attribution dependent affective state as a result of the perception of positive outcomes and the perception that the sources of those outcomes are external. and that positive results are perceived as external[26].

McCullough, Emmons, and Tsang (2002) explain the disposition of gratitude in terms of the 4 aspects of intensity, frequency, span, and density[19]. Intensity means a person with a high disposition of gratitude is significantly grateful when he or she has a positive experience, while frequency means that a person with a high disposition of gratitude finds more things to be grateful for in the same daily life, and span means that a person with a high disposition of gratitude is very grateful for his or her life, and density means that a person with a high disposition of gratitude is grateful to more people even for the same event.
2.2. Theory of meditation

Meditation began with yoga meditation in India and developed into the Buddhist meditation. Yoga meditation is based on the yoga scriptures compiled by an Indian yogi named Pantanjali around the 2nd century BC, and is based on the state of 'concentration, a state in which the mind is completely emptied by halting and controlling the agitation of mind and where only the object emits light. The Buddhist meditation leads to nirvana through transcendence, and nirvana is the most profound state of consciousness and refers to a state of awakening without an object of attachment.

As the meditation training methods thus developed in the east were introduced in the west, various meditation training methods were introduced as effective self-regulation techniques for promoting health and cope with stress, which include Transcendental Meditation, Benson's Relaxation Response Method, and Carrington's Clinical Standard Meditation Method.

Transcendental Meditation seeks to recover body and mind from against stress and tension through the mantra meditation under the premise that there is a transcendental state which is the happiest state of consciousness other than awakening, sleeping, and dreaming. Benson’s Relaxation Response Method is a meditation method for relieving stress or tension by repeatedly reciting specific words or phrases in a quiet environment and taking a comfortable posture with a passive attitude, and here, the passive posture refers to an attitude of letting go without worrying about scattered thoughts which arise during the meditation[27]. Carrington’s Clinical Standard Meditation Method uses a unique type of mantra meditation, which is a method for relieving stress or tension by selecting a favorite among the 16 mantras prepared by Carrington and reciting them repeatedly[28].

According to the classification of meditation researcher and psychologist Daniel Goleman, meditation may be divided into focused meditation and insight meditation. Focused meditation is a practice of yoga tradition, whereby one intentionally pays attention to and concentrates on an object. Insight meditation focuses on inner qualities like an eagle looking down from the sky. Vipassana meditation is a notable example. This meditation has already been introduced into psychotherapy in the United States, and is also called mindfulness meditation as a psychological term. The first step of mindfulness meditation is the ‘breath count.’ It is useful to observe by breathing while counting. That is, count from one to ten, then return to one and repeat as such. If one does it consistently, one can focus on just breathing. Observing the state of breathing by observing the entrance and exit of the breath, and observing the motion is called ‘breathing.’ When walking, noticing walking is called gyeonghaengseon or sanghaengseon, and when sitting, noticing something is called jawseon, and when standing, noticing something is called juseon, and noticing something while lying down is called waseon (Park, 1997)[29]. The types of meditation and methods of meditation examined in the above are presented in a table as follows.

Table 1. Types of meditation and methods of meditation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Classification criteria</th>
<th>Types of meditation</th>
<th>Sub classifications of meditation</th>
<th>Methods of meditation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Classification by purpose of meditation</td>
<td>Traditional meditation</td>
<td>- Meditation of absolute and metaphysical meanings</td>
<td>- Kuksendo, yoga, meditation, sanyeomcheo, TM, breathing practice method, dynamic meditation method</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Modern meditation</td>
<td>- Meditation of relative and experiential meanings</td>
<td>- Benson’s Relaxation Response Method, Carrington’s Clinical Standard Meditation Method</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Meditation whose purpose is to reach a state where one can see things in a clear, liberated, and fresh manner free of subjective prejudices and preconceived notions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classification by method of meditation</td>
<td>Focused meditation</td>
<td>Insight meditation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Sushikkwan, Ganhwaseon, Yeombulseon, modern meditation method, comprehensive method</td>
<td>- Vipassana meditation</td>
<td>- Meditation which focuses on an irrevocable single subject and subject of non-repetitive stimulus Meditation which focuses on sensations, images, actions, and illogical problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Danjeon breathing meditation, yoga Benson’s Relaxation Response Method, mind control, kukseondo, danhak</td>
<td>- Mind caring meditation</td>
<td>- Meditation which encourages one to be committed to the experience of every moment Meditation which enables one to directly experience the characteristics of existence</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Meditation is a psychological definition which emphasizes consciousness, but it may be said that it encompasses various mental and physical techniques to bring about a 'relaxation effect' in terms of mind and body medicine. Hence, studies have revealed the fact that such meditation techniques have a meaningful positive effect on the individuals in various dimensions of physical, emotional, and psychological aspects.

Soona Choi (2012) obtained significant results for the reduction of stress and stress levels such as interpersonal relationships, self problems, and school life as a result of performing meditation on middle school students[30]. Jeongeun Kim (2009) discovered the fact that self-efficacy increased and headache-induced stress decreased as a result of meditating with teachers[31]. Furthermore, meditation increased the satisfaction of life by reducing negative emotions, depression, and suicidal tendencies among high school girls (Jangseob Kim et al. 2, 2018)[32]. That is, it is apparent that meditation affects not only the emotional part but also the physical well-being. Studies in the form of a combination of meditation and various activities are also actively conducted. A study on the combination of dance motions and breathing (Sangbaek Kim, 2009)[33] and a study on the effectiveness of drawing and meditation programs (Jonghee Kim, 2009)[34] were effective in relieving psychological and physical symptoms by combining meditation with other activities. In addition to which, he reported on the effect of self-esteem and social self-esteem after performing integrated meditation for the middle school students.

2.3. Grateful meditation program

The grateful meditation program, which has traditionally been emphasized in religion or philosophy, is a program which seeks to enhance the individuals’ positive emotions by intentionally and repeatedly training the grateful mind, which has recently emerged as an important research topic in psychology, through meditation, and is a program which not only develops psychology, but also facilitates social relationships.

The methods of grateful meditation include breathing (breathing meditation), repeating recitation of words or phrases (mantra meditation), recalling a scene of gratitude (visualization meditation), and using motion (motion meditation).

Breathing grateful meditation is the act of observing and examining oneself by following the breath of inhalation and exhalation, then awakening the virtue of 'gratitude,' finding gratitude in small things of daily life, and awakening the gratitude and importance of one's existence.

According to Tedeschi & Calhoun (1996), those who say words of gratitude often have more flexible thinking. Furthermore, it is noted that, when faced with difficulties, those who do are not grateful often have negative thoughts, but those who are grateful often notice that it is not worse than the current difficulties[35]. The words of gratitude have a positive effect on the
strengthening of interpersonal relationships, and through the reinterpretation of external circumstances, they change the viewpoint and express gratitude[36].

The visualization grateful meditation is a way of evoking gratitude by recalling a scene of gratitude, and the motion grateful meditation make one feel grateful by repeating eye-motions or touching a specific part of the body, sitting, standing, or walking, etc.

3. Research Method

In order to address the research problem set for this study, a domestic study which confirms the effectiveness of the grateful meditation program was first selected. Among the dissertations presented by the RISS, there are a total of 39 studies which confirmed the effectiveness of the gratitude program, among which, 5 studies include those conducted by Jinhee Yang(2008)[37], Eunjoo Kim(2010)[38], Jaeyoon Hong(2014)[39], Hyejeong Min(2015)[40], and Sojeong Yoo(2016)[41], and while the title of grateful meditation program was not used, 3 studies including the contents on grateful meditation were those conducted by Donghee Kim (2008)[42], Deoknam Seo (2009)[43], Hangseok Jo (2010)[44]. For this study, these 8 research papers have been analyzed.

In order to examine and understand the contents of gratitude presented for the first research question, in the grateful meditation program, the contents of gratitude selected for the grateful meditation program was divided into one’s own body, one’s own existence, family, friends, neighbors, objects, and nature, for the examination of their contents. In order to examine and understand the meditation method selected for the second research question, in the grateful meditation program, the meditation method used was divided into preparation phase, development phase, and finishing phase, and as for the methods of meditation, they were divided into grateful meditation through breathing, grateful meditation through visualization, meditation through language (mantra meditation), and grateful meditation through motion for examination. In order to examine and understand the effect of the grateful meditation program, which is the third research question, the experimental design and statistical analysis method set for the study were presented, and the results of the statistical analysis for the variables set as the dependent variables were presented, and qualitative data such as questionnaire thoughts and researcher records were analyzed in a qualitative study or a study in parallel with qualitative study.

4. Research Results

In the comparative analysis of the study on the grateful meditation program conducted in Korea, the contents of gratitude included in each program were analyzed, the method of grateful meditation used in each program was analyzed, and the effectiveness of each program was examined. Prior to which, it is intended to generally review previous studies on the grateful meditation program.

4.1. Overview of previous studies on the grateful meditation program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Researcher</th>
<th>Title of paper</th>
<th>Subject of study</th>
<th>Implementation of program</th>
<th>Type of study</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Donghee Kim (2008)</td>
<td>The Effect of gratitude program on the subjective well-being of average high school students</td>
<td>47 high school students</td>
<td>30-50 minutes per session 14 sessions in total</td>
<td>Quantitative study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Qualitative study</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Donghee Kim (2008) developed a gratitude program by revising and supplementing the continuous meditation program among the donggaseob program, and the program was conducted over 14 sessions of 30-50 minutes per session for 47 general high school students (47 in the control group), and it was confirmed that the rage (5 sub-variables) of elementary school students decreased through this program[42].

Jinhee Yang (2008) developed a grateful meditation program by referring to Saedeok Oh's (2002) walking meditation and self-growth program and the experience of temple stay meditation at a temple, and the program was conducted over 12 sessions of 30 minutes per session for 25 elementary school students (25 in the control group), and it was confirmed that the elementary school students' self-esteem partially improved through this program[37].

Deoknam Seo (2009) developed a gratitude program referring to Donghee Kim's (2008) gratitude program and Kim Tae-yeon's (2006) forgiveness program, and the program was conducted over 10 sessions of 40-50 minutes per session for 30 elementary school students. Through this program, it was confirmed that the elementary school students' satisfaction of life improved, positive emotions improved, and negative emotions decreased. Furthermore, he reconfirmed the fact that it has an effect on the satisfaction of life and the positive and negative emotions by analyzing the thoughts prepared by the students participating in the program and the qualitative questionnaires performed on the pre- and post-test papers[43].

Hangseok Jo (2010) developed a gratitude program to cultivate disposition of gratitude by referring to Deborah Noville’s (2008, translated by Yongnam Kim) method of using gratitude notes and Jinhee Yang’s (2008) grateful meditation program, and the program was conducted over 14 sessions of 40 minutes per session for 27 elementary school students (27 in the control group), and it was confirmed that the disposition of gratitude of elementary school students was improved through this program[44]. Furthermore, it turned out that the children’s mind of gratitude increased based on the gratitude notes prepared by the students who participated in the program for each session.

Eunjoo Kim (2010) revised and supplemented the grateful meditation program developed by Jinhee Yang (2008) in line with the level of elementary school students, and the program was conducted over 12 sessions for 10 minutes per session for 23 elementary school students (23 in
the control group), and it was confirmed that this program is effective in improving the self-esteem of elementary school students[38].

Jaeyoon Hong (2014) developed a grateful meditation program to cultivate positive emotions and conducted this program for 24 average adults for 8 sessions of 50 minutes per session. As part of the qualitative research method, based on the emotions expressed in the thoughts prepared by the participants, he confirmed that, as a result of the analysis performed based on the questions of the positive scale of the positive and negative emotion scale developed by Watson et al. (1988), the positive emotions of the students participating in this program were cultivated[39].

Hyejeong Min (2015) formed the penitential meditation based on the meditation she had experienced and reconstructed grateful meditation by referring to the grateful meditation program developed by Donghee Kim and Jinhee Yang (2008). Thereafter, for 5 married women, 4 sessions of penitential meditation and 4 grateful meditation sessions were conducted for 90 minutes each session, and based on the participants' questionnaires, journals, impressions, transcripts, and the researcher's records, it was confirmed that the negative emotions decreased, positive emotions increased, and the human relationships were restored[40].

Sojeong Yoo (2016) developed the character education program using grateful meditation by using the “grateful meditation” of Jaeyoon Hong (2014), “physical grateful meditation program” of Soowon Park (2005), and the “cognitive behavioral gratitude program” of Haejeong Yoon (2011), and after conducting the program for 10 sessions of 70 minutes per session for 20 elementary school students (20 students in the control group), it was confirmed that the participants' self-esteem and peer relationships improved[41]. Furthermore, by analyzing the records of teachers and researchers and the thoughts of parents and children, she was confirmed that the children's concentration improved and their emotional stability and mood control were improved as well.

Gathering the 8 studies on the grateful meditation program in terms of the type of study, it turned out that 4 of them were quantitative studies, 2 were qualitative studies, and 2 were a combination of quantitative and qualitative studies. Examining the names of the program, 5 studies used the name of grateful meditation, and 3 studies did not use the name of grateful meditation, yet the contents of the program was consisted of grateful meditation.

In terms of study subjects, it turned out that there were 4 studies targeting elementary school children, 2 studies targeting middle and high school students, and 2 studies targeting adults. Furthermore, the grateful meditation program was conducted for over a total of 8 to 14 sessions, and the duration of each session turned out to be less than 30 minutes for one, five spanned 30 minutes to less than an hour per session, and 2 exceeded 1 hour, each respectively.

### 4.2. Contents included for the grateful meditation program

The grateful meditation program includes gratitude for self (one's own body and one's existence), gratitude for family, gratitude for friends, gratitude for neighbors, gratitude for things, gratitude for the nature, and the contents of gratitude reported by each study were examined.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Researcher</th>
<th>Title of paper</th>
<th>Details of gratitude</th>
<th>Special remark</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Donghee Kim (2008) sets the contents of gratitude differently for each session, including all of one’s own body, one’s own existence, family, friends, neighbors, objects, and the nature. What is unusual is that it includes the gratitude of “na-ji-sa,” which means the gratitude of “is the case—probably is—gratitude,” and it refers to being grateful by recalling recent events with negative emotions, objectifying them, and understanding them from another person’s point of view.

Jinhee Yang (2008) divides each part of the body (eyes, ears, nose, mouth, hands and feet, and appearance) into gratitude for each session, and further divides it into one’s own existence, one’s parents, and the nature (air, water, tree and soil), whereby the program was proceeded to ensure that one would have a grateful mind.

Deoknam Seo (2009) conducted a program to make people feel grateful for one’s own body, one’s own existence, family, friends, and objects around.

Hangseok Jo (2010) conducted a program to make people to have a grateful mind for one’s own body, friends, family, neighbors, and the nature. What is unusual is that the neighborhood was divided into teachers, schools, and grateful people and divided them by session.

Eunjoo Kim (2010), as did Jinhee Yang (2008), divided each part of the body (eyes, ears, nose, mouth, hands and feet, and appearance) by session to be grateful, one’s own existence, gratitude for parents, and the nature (air, water, wood, and soil), which were further divided by session, and the program was conducted to have a mind of gratitude.

Jaeyoon Hong (2014) divides gratitude for one’s self by session, and includes contents of gratitude for one’s own body (mind), one’s own existence, one’s own emotions, and one’s language, and also includes gratitude for you and gratitude for us.

Hyejeong Min (2015) conducted a program to make people to have a grateful mind for one’s own body, one’s mind, one’s strengths, family, friends, society, and the mother nature. What is unusual is that the gratitude of “na-ji-sa” is included.

Sojeong Yoo (2016) divides one’s own body’s gratitude by session into eyes, ears, nose, mouth,
chest, hands, and feet, and the feeling of gratitude for neighbors is added there [41].

Examining the contents of gratitude selected for the previous studies on the grateful meditation program, the gratitude for one's own body is included for all studies, followed by one's own existence (7), family (6), and neighbors, (5), nature (5), friends (4), and objects (2), respectively. It is unusual that 2 are also included for the gratitude of “na-ji-sa.”

4.3. Method of meditation used for the grateful meditation program

The method of meditation used for the grateful meditation program was divided into the preparation phase, development phase, and the finishing phase of the program for examination. The meditation method may generally be summarized into the medication through breathing, meditation through visualization, meditation through language (mantra meditation), and motion.

Table 4. Phased in method of meditation used for previous studies on the grateful meditation program.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Researcher</th>
<th>Title of paper</th>
<th>Method of meditation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Donghee Kim</td>
<td>The Effect of Gratitude Program on the Subjective Well-being of Average High School Students</td>
<td>Preparation phase: Breathing meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Development phase: Visualization meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finishing phase: (Sharing of thoughts)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jinhee Yang</td>
<td>The Effect of Gratitude Program on the Self-esteem of Middle School Students</td>
<td>Preparation phase: Breathing meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Development phase: Visualization meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finishing phase: Visualization meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deoknam Seo</td>
<td>The Effect of Gratitude Program on the Children's Anger Control</td>
<td>Preparation phase: Motion meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Development phase: Visualization meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finishing phase: Mantra meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hangseok Jo</td>
<td>A Study on the Development of Gratitude Program for the Cultivation of Disposition of Gratitude among Elementary School Students</td>
<td>Preparation phase: (Motivation via stories)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Development phase: Visualization meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finishing phase: Mantra meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eunjoo Kim</td>
<td>The Effect of Gratitude Program on the Self-esteem of Elementary School Students</td>
<td>Preparation phase: Breathing meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Development phase: Visualization meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finishing phase: Motion meditation Mantra meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jaeyoon Hong</td>
<td>Development of the Grateful Meditation Program for the Cultivation of Positive Emotions</td>
<td>Preparation phase: Breathing meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Development phase: Visualization meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finishing phase: (Sharing of thoughts)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hyejeong Min</td>
<td>A Study on Emotions and Changes in Relationships via Penitential Meditation and Grateful Meditation</td>
<td>Preparation phase: Breathing meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Development phase: Yoga meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Development phase: Visualization meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finishing phase: Motion meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sojeong Yoo</td>
<td>The Effect of Grateful Meditation Program on the Self-esteem and Peer Relationships among Elementary School Students</td>
<td>Preparation phase: Breathing meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Development phase: Mantra meditation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finishing phase: Sharing of thoughts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Deoknam Seo did not present the gratitude program on a phased in basis (2009).
Donghee Kim (2008) conducted the preparation phase with breathing meditation as a method of meditation, and developed it primarily by using the visualization method which recalls a scene of gratitude[42]. In the finishing phase, he did not take the form of meditation, yet finished by sharing thoughts. In particular, he includes a session which focuses on "na-ji-sa" meditation during the session, and it is a meditation method which makes one feel grateful 'notwithstanding which.'

Jinhee Yang (2008) carried out breathing meditation in the preparation phase and used visualization and motion meditation to remind people of things to be grateful for in the development phase, and in the finishing phase, visualization meditation, mantra meditation, and movement meditation such as eye exercise and ear touching were performed[37].

Deoknam Seo (2009) did not present the gratitude program by phase, yet primarily used the visualization method to recall the scene of gratitude as a meditation method, and in the finishing phase, he did not take on the form of meditation, yet finished it up sharing thoughts[43].

Hangseok Jo (2010) did not use the meditation method in the preparation phase, yet caused motivation by story telling, used the visualization method to recall the things to be grateful for in the development phase, then made them prepare gratitude notes. and in the finishing phase, the method of mantra meditation was used to express the words of 'Thank you for XXX' [44].

Eunjoo Kim (2010) used the visualization method to recall things to be grateful for in the development phase to begin with, followed by the meditation through breathing in the preparation phase, and used the method of meditation through motions such as eye-exercise or ear-touching in the finishing phase, finishing it up with words of affirmation via the mantra meditation[38].

Jaeyoon Hong (2014) used an appropriate mix of the visualization method which reminds one of something to be grateful for in the development phase to begin with, followed by the meditation through breathing in the preparation phase, and the mantra method of feeling the words of 'Thank you,' and the motion meditation, finishing it up with the sharing of thoughts[39].

Hyejeong Min (2015) conducted the breathing meditation and yoga meditation in the preparation phase, visualization meditation, mantra meditation, and motion meditation in parallel in the development phase, and in the finishing phase, finished it up with the sharing of thoughts and the preparation of a meditation journal[40]. She specifically includes sessions using the meditation of “na-ji’sa” during the sessions.

Sojeong Yoo (2016) conducted the breathing meditation in the preparation phase, mantra meditation and motion meditation in the development phase, and finished it up by sharing thoughts in the finishing phase[41].

Gathering the meditation methods of the grateful meditation program presented thus far, in the preparation phase, the meditation through breathing is generally used, and in the development phase, meditation through visualization, meditation through language (mantra meditation), and motion meditation are appropriately used in parallel as it is apparent. In the finishing phase, visualization meditation, motion meditation, mantra meditation, and sharing of feelings which did not take on the form of meditation were the most, respectively.

### 4.4. Effect of the grateful meditation program

In order to examine and understand the effect of the grateful meditation program, the experimental design and statistical analysis method set for each study were presented, and the results of statistical analysis of the variables set as dependent variables were presented, and in the qualitative study, the results of analyzing qualitative data such as questionnaire thoughts and researchers’ records were briefly presented.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Researcher</th>
<th>Title of paper</th>
<th>Experimental design and the method of statistical analysis</th>
<th>Effect of program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Table 5.** Effect of the grateful meditation program.
Donghee Kim (2008) conducted the gratitude program by designing an experiment-control group for 47 high school students (47 people in the control group), and presented the results by the covariate analysis. In the study, the satisfaction of life set as a dependent variable improved (F = 19.4, p < .001), positive emotions were improved (F = 16.8, p < .001), and negative emotions decreased (F = 14.5, p < .001) respectively.

Jinhee Yang (2008) conducted the grateful meditation program for 25 middle school students (25 students in the control group) by designing an experiment-control group, and presented the results by the repeated measurement t-test, which was set as a dependent variable for the study, and it turned out that the disposition of gratitude was significantly improved (t=5.11, p<.001), positive emotions were improved (F = 19.4, p < .001), and negative emotions were decreased (F = 14.5, p < .001) respectively.

Deoknam Seo (2009) conducted the gratitude program for 30 elementary school students, and presented the results by the repeated measurement t-test, which was set as a dependent variable for the study, and it turned out that the disposition of gratitude was significantly improved (t=5.11, p<.001), positive emotions were improved (F = 19.4, p < .001), and negative emotions were decreased (F = 14.5, p < .001) respectively.

Hangseok Jo (2009) conducted the gratitude program for 27 elementary school students (27 in the control group), and presented the results by the repeated measures analysis of variance, and it turned out that the disposition of gratitude was significantly improved (F = 7.79, p < .01) and family self-esteem (F = 9.06, p < .01) significantly improved, yet social self-esteem and school self-esteem did not significantly improve (F = 9, respectively). 1.75, p>.05; F = 3.80, p>.05) [37].

Deoknam Seo (2009) conducted the gratitude program based on a single group design for 30 elementary school students, and presented the results by the repeated measurement t-test, and state anger (t= 2.88, p<.01), characteristic anger (t= 2.68, p<.05), anger suppression (t= 2.73, p<.05), anger expression (t=3.74, p<.001), and anger control (t=3.25, p<.01), which were set as dependent variables in the study, all demonstrated significant effects [43].

Hangseok Jo (2010) conducted the gratitude program by designing an experiment-control group for 27 elementary school students (27 in the control group), and presented the results by the repeated measures analysis of variance, and it turned out that the disposition of gratitude was significantly improved (t=5.11, p<.001) [44].

Eunjoo Kim (2010) conducted a grateful meditation program by designing an experimental-control group for 23 elementary school students (23 students in the control group), and presented the results by the repeated measures analysis of variance, and it turned out that the self-esteem set as the dependent variable for the study was significantly improved (F=13.48, p<.001), positive emotions were improved (F=16.8, p<.001), and negative emotions were decreased (F=14.5, p<.001) respectively.
Jaeyoon Hong (2014) conducted a grateful meditation program for 24 average adults and based on the questions of positive and negative emotion scales developed by Watson et al. (1988) based on the emotions expressed in the thoughts prepared by the participants, and as a result of the analysis performed, he reported that the positive emotions of the students participating in this program were cultivated.

Hyejeong Min (2015) conducted devastating meditation and grateful meditation for 5 married women, and based on the questionnaires, journals, thoughts, transcripts, and records of the participants, he reported that negative emotions decreased and positive emotions increase, while human relationships were restored.

Sojeong Yoo (2016) conducted the grateful meditation program based on an experimental-control group design for 20 elementary school students (20 students in the control group), and presented the results by the covariate analysis, and it turned out that the self-esteem set as a dependent variable for the study was improved (F=347.2, p<.001), and peer relationships improved (F=753.5, p<.001).

Gathering the effects of the grateful meditation program reported by the previous studies, excluding the 2 sub-variables (social self-esteem and school related self-esteem) among the self-esteem related sub-variables set as dependent variables in Jinhee Yang (2008)'s study, it is apparent that the grateful meditation program is effective for all the dependent variables (satisfaction of life, positive and negative emotions, self-esteem, anger, disposition of gratitude, and interpersonal relationship) set in the 8 studies. Hence, the grateful meditation program is a powerful program which promotes cognitive, emotional, and behavioral changes for the participants.

5. Discussion and Conclusions

This study has examined the effects of grateful meditation programs conducted in Korea (for a total of 8 papers), and analyzed the contents of the gratitude and meditation methods set by such programs, while analyzing the relevant effects of such programs on various psychological variables. To achieve this purpose, among the dissertations in Korea (a total of 39) confirming the effectiveness of the gratitude program, the study with the name of grateful meditation (total 5) and the name of grateful meditation were not used, yet a total of 8 dissertations were selected and analyzed including the studies whose contents were grateful meditation (for a total of 3).

The study results are as follows. First, it turned out that the contents of gratitude selected for the previous studies on the grateful meditation program was the most for gratitude for one's own body (8), existence (7), family (6), neighbors (5), nature (5), friends (4), and objects (2), respectively. Second, as for the meditation method adopted for the grateful meditation program, in the preparation phase, meditation through breathing has generally been used, and in the development phase, meditation through visualization, meditation through language (mantra meditation), and motion meditation have been used in combination, while in the finishing phase, visualization meditation, motion meditation, mantra meditation, and sharing of feelings which did not take on the form of meditation were the most, respectively. Third, gathering the effects of the grateful meditation program, it turned that it was effective across all dependent variables (satisfaction of life, positive and negative emotions, self-esteem, anger, disposition of gratitude, and interpersonal relationship) set in 8 studies. Hence, the grateful meditation program is a powerful program which promotes cognitive, emotional, and behavioral changes for the participants.

What ought to be discussed in generalizing such analytical results is that there is a limit to generalization in that only 8 studies have been analyzed for this study. In this study, all of the
dissertations on the grateful meditation program were selected from among the dissertations presented by the RISS, and while there were also a few papers reported in the academic journals, they could not be selected since there was no specific information about the program.

The following implications were acquired from undertaking this study. First, the future grateful meditation program ought to change the contents of the gratitude according to age. When targeting the relatively younger children, the contents of gratitude ought to be set at the specific level of individual, and when targeting high school students or adults, it ought to be internalized at the abstract level of the individual’s attributes. Second, the method of meditation ought to also change according to age. It would be best if mantra meditation, visualization meditation, and motion meditation are primarily used for the relatively younger children, and breathing meditation, yoga meditation, and "na-ji-sa" meditation would be good for adults including high school students. Third, the contents of gratitude or the method of meditation ought to be changed according to the dependent variables to be improved through the grateful meditation program. In particular, when the dependent variables are relatively complex variables, the contents of gratitude ought to be diversified and the method of meditation ought to be used comprehensively. Fourth, if the ‘time of consideration for myself’ is preceded by the grateful meditation’s preparatory program for palpating one’s cognition, emotions, and actions, it would be possible to proceed more effectively and in depth during the development phase of grateful meditation.

The grateful meditation program is a powerful program for promoting cognitive, emotional, and behavioral changes for the participants, and hence, it will be widely used moving forward, and a more systematic program will be developed to address the problems of stress, anxiety, and alienation for the modern people. Furthermore, by combining such grateful meditation program with other programs, such as kokseondo meditation, yoga meditation, zen meditation, and danhak meditation, the program could further develop and proceed even more effectively.

6. References

6.1. Journal articles


6.1. Thesis degree


[41] Yoo SJ. The Effect of Thanks Meditation Program as a Part of Personality Education on the Elementary School Students' Self-Esteem and Peer Relationship. Dongguk University, Master’s Thesis (2016).


6.2. Books


7. Appendix

7.1. Authors contribution

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Initial name</th>
<th>Contribution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lead Author</td>
<td>• Set of concepts☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Design☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Getting results☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Analysis☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Make a significant contribution to collection☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Final approval of the paper☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Corresponding☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corresponding Author*</td>
<td>• Play a decisive role in modification☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Significant contributions to concepts, designs, practices, analysis and interpretation of data☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Participants in Drafting and Revising Papers☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Someone who can explain all aspects of the paper☑</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>